Citizens' Group on Electoral Process

REPORT FACT FINDING MISSION TO ATTOCK



Contents

Introduction

Programme

Background

Purpose and Scope of the CGEP Fact Finding Mission

Major Complaints

Discussion with the Parties Concerned & Analysis of the Complaints

Conclusion

Appendices

Appendix A: Programme of the CGEP Fact Finding Mission

Appendix B: Electoral Race in the District of Attock

Introduction

The Citizens Group on Electoral Process – CGEP, facilitated by PILDAT, undertook a Fact Finding Mission to Attock on Tuesday, January 15, 2008. Following CGEP members comprised the Fact Finding Mission:

- 1. Justice (Retd.) Saeed uz Zaman Siddiqui; Chairman CGEP; Former Chief Justice of Pakistan
- 2. Dr. Ijaz Shafi Gilani, Member CGEP; Chairman Gallup, Pakistan
- 3. Lt. Gen. (Retd.) Moinuddin Haider, Member CGEP, Former Governor Sindh and Federal Interior Minister
- 4. Mr. Rahimullah Yusufzai, Member CGEP, Executive Editor, The News Peshawer
- 5. Mr. Shahid Hamid, Former Governor Punjab
- 6. Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob, Executive Director PILDAT
- 7. Ms. Aasiya Riaz, Joint Director PILDAT

Programme

The CGEP Fact Finding Mission met and interacted with the District Nazim Attock; the DCO; the DPO; the District Returning Officer; the three Returning Officers, Candidates for National and Provincial Assembly Constituencies belonging to the PML-N, PML-Q, PPP, MMA and Independents, the Assistant Election Commissioner and the local News Media. A detailed programme of the visit is attached as *Appendix A*.

Background

The Attock District has been receiving extraordinary media attention ahead of elections. One reason for that has been that 3 close relatives of the District Nazim Attock Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq are contesting for the three National Assembly (NA) seats in the district and allegedly, the District Nazim has been using his position, influence and district government resources in these three election campaigns. There are 41 candidates in the run for three (3) National Assembly (NA 57, Attock-I, NA-57 Attock-II and NA 58 Attock-III) and five (5) Provincial Assembly seats (PP-15 Attock-I, PP-16 Attock-II, PP-17 Attock-III, PP-18 Attock-IV, PP-19 Attock-V) in Attock district. Ms. Eman Waseem is a former MNA from NA-59, Attock-III who had resigned from her seat to make room for the election of Mr. Shaukat Aziz who later became Prime Minister in August 28, 2004 after his election from this constituency. She is the daughter of the District Nazim and an independent candidate from National Assembly Constituency NA-57, Attock-I. Former Punjab Chief Minister and an aspirant for the office of the Prime Minister, Chaudhry Pervaiz Elahi is District Nazim Attock's brother-in-law and is a candidate of the PML-Q from the National Assembly Constituency NA-58, Attock II. Ms. Eman Waseem's

husband, the son-in-law of District Nazim, Mr. Waseem Gulzar is contesting on a PML-Q ticket from NA-59 Attock-III. A detailed list of all candidates is attached as *Appendix B*.

Another prominent aspect of the election race in Attack is that 15 candidates belonging to different political parties as well as Independents contesting on NA and PA seats have formed an alliance called the *Front for Free and Fair Elections* Terming it as the only initiative of its kind in Pakistan, the candidates forming the Front include those from all major parties (PPP, PML-N, MMA and independents) who are contesting elections against each other but are together on the one point agenda of ensuring a fair election. This Front demands a free and transparent election and has vowed to collectively strive for that purpose by exposing the pre-poll rigging and jointly raising it with the Election Commission of Pakistan. The coordinator and spokesman for the Front, Malik Amin Aslam Khan, former MNA from NA-57 and former Minister of State for Environment, who is now contesting election as an independent candidate from NA-57 Attock-I, contacted PILDAT after receiving news of activities of CGEP, informing us of a list of issues the Front has raised with the ECP including:

- "Open violations" of the ECP rules by the District Nazim Attock who is allegedly openly utilising government resources, government premises and his office for campaigning for what the Front terms as three "invisible" and "imported" NA candidates which include his daughter, son-in-law and brother-in law (Ch Pervaiz Elahi) contesting on NA57, NA 59 and NA 58 respectively.
- A plan for coercing all government employees (about 15000 in the district) to vote for the above candidates through forced postal balloting as well as open intimidation.
- Blatant police interference and intimidation tactics which have significantly escalated since the delay announced in the election date."

The Front claims all of the above complaints have been sent to the ECP with "ample proofs" but in the spokesman's words, "the ECP seems to be in a state of "organised paralysis" and "in the mood to just push issues under the rug through a "paper shuffling" exercise aimed at collecting reports without any meaningful action."

Purpose and Scope of the CGEP Fact Finding Mission

The purpose of the CGEP Fact Finding Mission has been to analyse and assess the situation on the ground in the light of the complaints by the Attock Front for Free and Fair Elections and complaints highlighted in the national media and to issue an objective report to the media, all concerned and the ECP highlighting the CGEP findings. This is in line with the CGEP's role to assess the pre-poll electoral environment for fairness.

Major Complaints

The Citizens Group conducted the Fact Finding Mission in the backdrop of six (6) major complaints received from District Attock:

- 1. District Nazim allegedly using district resources and influence of his position to support/run election campaign of his daughter and former MNA Eman Waseem (NA-57 Attock-I: Independent); his brother-in-law and former Punjab Chief Minister Chaudhry Pervaiz Elahi (NA-58, Attack-II: PML-Q) and his son-in-law Waseem Gulzar (NA-59 Attock-III: PML-Q). Many national and local newspapers carried news of open canvassing and campaigning by the District Nazim Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq for the PML-Q candidates. The alleged role of the District Nazim and of the District Government Officers is directly in violation of Articles 81 (a, b, e), 82 (a) and 92 of the Representation of the Peoples Act, 1976.1
- 2. Planning and preparation for Rigging by the District Government through filing applications for "massive" number of postal ballots for government employees

(1) in order to induce or compel any person to vote or refrain from voting, or to offer himself as a candidate, or to withdraw his candidature, at an election, directly or indirectly, by himself or by any other person on his behalf ---

- a) makes or threatens to make use of any force, violence or restraint;
- b) inflicts or threatens to inflict any injury, damage, harm or loss;
- c) (e) uses any official influence or governmental patronage; ...

Article 82A. Capturing of polling station and polling booth, etc. --- Whoever

- a) seizes a seizes a polling station or a place fixed for the poll or makes polling authorities surrender the ballot papers or ballot box or both and doing of any other act which affects the orderly conduct of elections;
- b) takes possession of a polling station for a place fixed for the poll and allows his supporters to exercise their right to vote and prevent others from free exercise of their right to vote;
- c) coerces, intimidates or threatens directly any elector and prevents him from going to the polling station or a place fixed for the poll to cast his vote; or
- d) being in the service of Government or corporations or institutions controlled by the Government of all or any of the aforesaid activities or aids or connives at, any such activity in the furtherance of the prospects of the election of a candidate,

shall be guilty of an offence punishable with imprisonment shall be guilty of an offence punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than three years and may extend to five years and with fine which shall not be less than fifty thousands rupees and may extend to one hundred thousands rupees or with both."

Article 92. Assistance by Government Servant. A person in the service of Pakistan is guilty of an offence punishable with imprisonment for a term which may extend to two year, or with fine which may extend to two thousand rupees, or with both, if he misuses his official position in a manner calculated to influence the results of the election.

¹ Article 81. Undue influence. --- A person is guilty of undue influence, if he ---

(about 15000 in the district). The government employees allegedly being forced to submit their Identity Cards to district authorities for filing applications for postal ballots

- 3. Mass scale recruitment by the District Government in departments like Police on the eve of announcement of election schedule in an alleged bid to influence the election result
- 4. Terms of appointment of all contract employees in the Attock District extended up to 60 years of age on the eve of election as a political bribe
- 5. Alleged police intimidation of candidates contesting against the PML-Q supported candidates through registration of Open ended First Information Reports (FIRs) and other means
- 6. Initiation of new development schemes in the districts after the announcement of election schedule

Discussion with the Parties Concerned & Analysis of the Complaints

At the outset, CGEP would like to thank the district authorities, all candidates and government officials for their support and cooperation extended to the CGEP Mission. Not only all entities and individuals contacted to seek meetings responded positively to CGEP requests but extended all cooperation during meetings and interaction with the CGEP Mission. We are also grateful to the media, both electronic and print, for their extensive coverage and support without which our efforts to contribute towards holding of free, fair and transparent elections in Attock and elsewhere can not succeed.

The CGEP Mission interacted and engaged with the key authorities and candidates belonging to all political parties and groups keeping in view the six (6) major complaints outlined above. Following are the findings of the CGEP Fact Finding Mission in relation to these complaints:

1. District Nazim using district resources and influence of his position to support/run campaign:

In the meeting with District Nazim Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq, the Citizens Group discussed in detail the issue of reported campaigning and the use of district resources by the Nazim in support of electoral campaign of his daughter and the PML-Q candidates in the district. The Group had also seen such posters and hoardings in the city that carried the District Nazim's pictures, especially those in favour of his daughter's candidacy. The Citizens Group had also learnt from the

news media and other candidates that a substantial number of posters and hoardings were removed from Attock in the one or two days prior to the visit of CGEP Fact Finding Mission to Attock. The Group had also noted the absence of compliance with the ECP Code in terms of the sizes of posters and hoardings as well as the presence of wall-chalking despite the ECP regulations. The Group pointed out to the District Nazim his and his government's responsibilities prescribed in the law as contained in the provisions of Sections 83-A and 92 of the Representation of the Peoples Act and the Code of Conduct prescribed by the Election Commission of Pakistan.

The District Nazim admitted that there were a number of posters and hoardings bearing his picture showing his affiliation with and support of PML-Q candidates that have been put up all over Attock city and reportedly throughout the Attock district. When pointed out to the District Nazim that such posters and hoardings, which were otherwise much large than the size allowed by the Election Commission, coupled with his reported addresses at public meetings in support of PML-Q candidates, amounted to undue influencing of the voters in violation of the provisions of Sections 83-A and 92 of the Representation of the Peoples Act and the Code of Conduct prescribed by the Election Commission, he replied that he had nothing to do with the posters and hoardings bearing his pictures, that they had been put up by his friends and supporters and that he had ordered the DCO to take those down.

The District Nazim, however, pointed out that his sympathies were with the PML-Q as a political party and that it was unnatural for him to dissociate himself from his daughter who was contesting the election. He said that his sympathies were with the PML-Q in his person and not in his capacity as the district Nazim. He said that the PML-Q will reap the benefits of the unprecedented development work carried out by him in the district. He, however, did not believe it was a conflict of interest in any way that his daughter, son-in-law and brother-in-law were contesting election while he held the post of district Nazim.

The Nazim said that most of "his political opponents" contesting election were those who had contested the election of District Nazim. He said that it was the "defeatist mentality" of the "opposing" candidates that they kept filing complaints against him alleging he was influencing election. He said that due to these complaints, he was called many times by the District Returning Officer to explain his position and regretted that this wasted his and the district government's precious time away from their responsibilities.

Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq believed that most of the electoral rules and codes were not in keeping with the realities on the ground. The office of District Nazim is an elected office and Nazim comes through support provided by political groups. To expect Nazim to remain aloof from the same political atmosphere that elected him is unnatural. He also believed that local government elections should be held on the basis of political party affiliations. He complained that if the district government strictly followed compliance to the regulations and took down posters and hoardings not in conformity with prescribed sizes, there will be a lot of hue and cry that the district government was politically victimising candidates. When asked why the district government under his leadership not approached the Election Commission to give its recommendations for a more realistic Code of Conduct, he said that he was not contacted by the ECP for any input in the Code of Conduct or any other rule.

In the presence of the CGEP Mission, Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq instructed the DCO and the DPO to take down any hoardings carrying his pictures and those not in conformity with the sizes prescribed by the ECP. The CGEP Mission stressed to the Nazim, the DCO and the DPO that the posters and hoardings should not be put back after the Mission had gone, and took note of the Nazim's assurance that he was proceeding on leave for performance of Umra and would extend his leave till after the elections on February 18, 2008.

The District Nazim denied having taken part in the electoral campaign. When pointed out that other than complaints by electoral candidates, even national newspapers such as Jang Rawalpindi reported him to be addressing election rallies urging other district functionaries to openly take part in the election campaign in favour of the PML-Q, he denied ever having addressed the rally and pointed it to be a fictitious news item. In the presence of CGEP Mission, Major (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq instructed his staff to send a notice to the newspaper refuting the news story.

2. Planned Rigging by the District Government through filing applications for "massive" number of postal ballots for government employees (about 15000 in the district):

The PML-N, PPP, Independent and other candidates had all complained of plans for massive postal ballot rigging. It was alleged that identity cards had been obtained from 'thousands' of government employees in the district so as to enable casting of more than 15000 postal ballots in favour of the PML-Q or PML-Q supported candidates.

In its meeting with the DCO and the DPO, the CGEP Mission put forward this complaint but this was denied by both officers. However, the officials accompanying the DPO informed the Group that over 1400 applications were

sent from the Police department "in the personal capacity of police employees." In the light of new inductions of 1400 new police employees, this was a significant number, the Group believed. Since the total number of Police employees in the District including the new inductions is 2376, the applicants for postal ballots constitute 59 % of the total employees, which indeed is an extraordinarily high number.

Later in its meeting with the District Returning Officer, the Group specifically inquired into the complaint seeking the numbers of postal ballot applications received and the number of postal ballots issued by the DRO. The details provided by the DRO's office are as under:

| Constituency | Total Applications received for | Number of Applications Rejected by | Number of Applications approved / | Remarks |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| | Postal Ballots | ROs/DRO | Ballots | |
| | | • | Issued | |
| NaA-57, | 1677 | 969 | 708 | 58 % of the |
| Attock-I | | | | total |
| | | | | applications |
| | | | | were |
| | | | | rejected |
| NA-58, | 2992 | 2393 | 599 | 80 % of the |
| Attock-II | | | | total |
| | | | | applications |
| | | | | were |
| | | | | rejected |
| NaA-59, | 1178 | 813 | 365 | 69 % of the |
| Attock-III | | | | total |
| | | | | applications |
| | | | | were |
| | | | | rejected |
| Total | 5847 | 4175 | 1672 | 71 % of the |
| | | | | total |
| | | | | applications |
| | | | | in the three |
| | | | | constituenci |
| | | | | es were |
| | | | | rejected |

These details indicate that the total number of postal ballots finally issued were not so high as was being alleged by some of the candidates. However, it appears

that there was an organised effort to seek a relatively large number of postal ballots but the scrutiny at the Returning Officer's level has prevented to a great extent the possibility of misuse of this facility, even if there was an organised effort in this direction initially. The DRO informed the Group that he noticed that most of the applications received were in bulk and had a pattern; which also meant that if there was one technical flaw with one application in a bulk, all others carried the same flaw. In 2002 election, the average number of postal ballots actually used was around 200 per National Assembly constituency. The average of postal ballots issued for the 2008 election comes to 557 per constituency in the three National Assembly Constituencies of District Attock.

The Group had learnt that in previous election, postal ballots figured prominently in District Attock on at least one Provincial Assembly seat (PP 15 Attock-I) in which one of the MMA candidates (now in PML-Q) had been 24 votes behind the winning candidate before the Postal Ballots were counted but received a superiority of 45 votes and won after the postal ballots received had been counted. The Citizens Group has requested the Election Commission of Pakistan to provide the data of applications of postal ballots received in the District of Attock in the previous elections so as to carry out a detailed comparison for analysis.

In view of the widespread impression of thousands of postal ballots being issued in Attock district and the reality as communicated by the DRO being different, the Citizens Group suggested to the DRO that he may consider issuing of a press release from time to time about complaints received and actions taken to keep the press and the candidates informed on the real picture.

3. Mass scale recruitment in the Police on the eve of Election Schedule:

One of the major complaints against the district government in Attock has been that it has carried out large number of recruitments ahead of election 2008 as a way of political bribe and to influence the voting pattern of a large number of households in the district benefited through the recruitment in favour of the former ruling party, the PML-Q.

Upon investigation into this issue, the Citizens Group learnt that the sanctioned strength of Police in Attock District prior to the commencement of the election process was about 900. 1476 fresh recruits were inducted as constables through an order dated September 27, 2007, less than 6 weeks ahead of the announcement of the election schedule. The DPO, a new comer to the district appointed on September 8, 2007, informed CGEP Mission that new recruitments in Police were

not unique to District Attock and a total of 20,000 new recruits were approved for all districts of the Punjab.

The Group learnt, through its conversation with the DPO, that while the new recruits received their salaries, little or no training was provided to them since September 2007 because training facilities were not available for such a large number of recruits. Since the other facilities were also inadequate for such a large number of inductees, these new recruits have been living in tents donated for earthquake victims since their induction. However, DPO informed that he was providing informal training to new recruits and had begun to use these new recruits for night time and otherwise duty in police stations across the district (without any formal training).

4. Terms of appointment of all contract employees in the Attock District extended up to 60 years of age on the eve of Election:

On November 20, 2007, the day of the dissolution of the Punjab Assembly, and the very date on which the Election Commission announced the schedule of January 2008 election, all contract employees in the Attock District who were appointed for a period of 5 years had their terms of appointment extended up to 60 years of age - on the basis of approval given by the previous Chief Minister Punjab, Chaudhry Pervaiz Ilahi (also a candidate on NA 58, Attock-III) to a summary directly sent to him by the DCO Attock. Apparently the concerned Local Government Department and other departments such as Finance and Law were not consulted and even the Chief Secretary was not shown the summary on its way back - all in prima facie non-conformance to the Punjab Government's Rules of Business. In addition, while the order carries the date on which it was issued by the DCO (November 20, 2007), it does not carry the date on which it received the sanction by the former Chief Minister Punjab Chaudhry Pervaiz Ilahi, which further calls into question the nature and motive of this action. According to information provided by the DCO, Attock is now in the unique position, in the entire province of Punjab, of having contract employees who will now serve up to the superannuation age viz 60 years. The DCO informed the Group that he had moved the summary on October 20, 2007 on the basis of a resolution of the District Council passed on August 8, 2006. The Group noted that the summary was moved after the lapse of 15 months after the District Council resolution and so close to the general election.

While the move apparently benefits all the employees district-wide without any discrimination, as claimed by the district administration, the action clearly falls into the domain of pre-poll rigging as an attempt by both the district government and the previous Punjab Government to influence the election result.

5. Alleged police intimidation against election candidates contesting against the PML-Q candidates

The Citizens Group had received complaints from candidates that they were subjected to the excesses and intimidation of Police, allegedly on the behest of District Nazim, against his political opponents. Following the assassination of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto on December 27, 2007 and a rally of the PPP in Attock, which the PPP candidates claimed to be entirely peaceful, Police lodged FIRs against the PPP and other candidates for allegedly wrecking public and private property. So far, the Group was informed, 3 FIRs were lodged by Police, out of which one was sealed. A large number of unnamed people were nominated as culprits, which the opposition candidates alleged, was a ploy to get sweeping access to harass their workers and lock-up anyone. The PPP candidates claimed that the Police had arrested a two workers and only released them a night before.

The DPO denied using the police force for any intimidation. He also categorically denied that anyone was arrested following the FIRs. He, however, said that FIRs lodged were logical as the participants of the rally had destroyed public and private property and even burnt the national flag. The CGEP members pointed out that 16 MPO can not be used indiscriminately against unnamed person but can only be invoked against a particular person. The three FIRs had a large number of up to 300 persons unnamed accused persons per FIR which means a large number of people can be apprehended at a later date.

The Group stressed to the DCO and the DPO that as the employees of the state, it was a responsibility of the two officers and the district government apparatus to not victimize a party or individual but to ensure a level-playing field.

6. Continuation of development schemes and initiation of new development schemes in the districts after the announcement of election schedule

The Citizens Group had also received complaints that the District Nazim went around announcing development schemes across the district in lieu of commitment of vote from different villages and areas. Although no specific proof was forwarded, the candidates alleged that only a couple of days ago, in a village called Maari Jhalwaal, the District Nazim had given Rs. 2 million to be used on electrification if the village committed to vote in favour of the PML-Q candidates.

The District Nazim denied having announced any new development scheme or programme after the announcement of the election schedule. He, however, said that development schemes sanctioned before the announcement of election schedule were on-going in the district. The charge was vehemently denied by the DCO as well. He pointed out that as the Chief Accounting Officer of the district; he had not sanctioned money for any new projects or schemes.

Conclusion

- 1. The CGEP wishes to underscore that it neither has the resources nor the intention to thoroughly investigate all the complaints in a short-term fact finding mission like this. The citizens initiative like this has a limited purpose and it neither can nor should be a substitute for the state apparatus put in place for the purpose. A system can only work fairly and efficiently when the state institutions carry out their responsibilities and functions within the parameters prescribed in the law.
- 2. Given the availability of time, resources and our mandate it would NOT be appropriate that our Group provides a judgment on the level of fairness in the Election in the District of Attock. HENCE THIS REPORT IS NOT A JUDGEMENT. The Report tries its best to capture, through the eyes of an independent Election Watching Group, the general electoral environment in this one district. In the process we also made our modest effort to use our Monitoring activity as a deterrent against unfair practices in the Elections, by the state functionaries, ruling party and the opposition groups.
- 3. The CGEP Fact Finding Mission to Attock witnessed great interest by the candidates and media indicating that an independent credible initiative was needed to monitor the electoral process for fairness mainly because the state institutions unfortunately lacked the trust of the people.
- 4. The CGEP Mission also noted with satisfaction and gratitude that all candidates and officials agreed to meet, answer questions and share the information. We would like to appreciate their cooperation in extending all possible support to us.
- 5. Notwithstanding their political differences the level of political polarization appeared to be moderate and civil. While political groups criticized each other the discourse was by and large civil and reasonably respectful of each other.
- 6. The state machinery may in some instances be in breach of law, but they were adequately aware of what the law required and at least in theory respectful to it.
- 7. The infrastructure of a city government, electoral administration, civic institutions and political parties was in place. With a little more effort and an honest signal, and respect for rule of law, from the leadership at the highest level, Pakistan is not far from beginning to practice a functioning democracy and to move on to the path of Good Governance
- 8. In its detailed interaction with various candidates, District Government Officials, the District Nazim and the Media in the light of various allegations of pre-poll

rigging being orchestrated by the District Nazim, the CGEP Mission is of the view that apparently the grip of the Nazim is very strong on the district establishment and politics. His daughter is a former MNA; he provided seat to the former Prime Minister Shaukat Aziz to contest election from Attock; he is a close relative of Mr. Pervaiz Elahi, the former Chief Minister Punjab and an aspirant of Prime Ministership in the coming election as well as of Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain, the President of the PML-Q and another former Prime Minister. The district resources apparently are being pressed into the election campaign as seen through the press reports continuously published and the clout of the District Nazim is being used, although it is apparently vehemently denied by the Nazim and the district administration.

- 9. The Group, however, notes with regret that reports coming from other districts across the country tell a tale not entirely different from what is happening in District Attock. Attock district may be receiving more attention because here a prominent candidate is contesting election and all the three National Assembly constituencies are being contested by the Nazim's close relatives.
- 10. At least 2 instances that amount to pre-poll rigging and political bribe to influence voters by the district administration under the Nazim have been recorded by the Citizens Group. One is the regularization of contract employees across the district upon authorization of the former Punjab Chief Minister, who in this case is a direct beneficiary as a contesting candidate. Second is the mass scale recruitment in the Police ahead of election where 1476 new employees have been recruited in the existing number of 900 police force in the district although the district does not have the resources yet to train or house the new inductees and is unable to fully use the services of new employees who are receiving salaries but are not in a position to undertake responsibilities in lieu of the salaries.
- 11. The Citizens Group would recommend that given the high profile candidate and uniqueness of the district as very close relatives of the Nazim are contesting, the ECP and the DRO/ROs should closely watch the developments and take urgent notice of any violation.
- 12. The District Nazim and the PML-Q candidates, in separate meetings with the CGEP Fact Finding Mission, expressed their confidence of winning their seats on the basis of the many development works completed during the last 5 years. The CGEP Mission saw evidence of such development during our visit to Attock and said to the Nazim and the PML-Q candidates that if they were confident of victory on the basis of their record, then they should themselves ensure against attempts to influence voters in violation of law so as not to taint the result

anticipated by them. We would like to record that at least some of the PML-Q and pro-PML-Q candidates agreed with us.

- 13. The Citizens Group is of the considered view that reforms are needed to stop Local Government interference and influence through its resources. The legal framework on the ground appears to be weak to arrest such a large-scale influence. Theoretically, the Election Commission has the powers to curtail this influence but in practice appears unable to do so. In the words of the Chief Election Commissioner himself, most of the electoral complaints received by the ECP are those of the excesses of the district governments but what action has the ECP taken to stop this so far remains unclear.
- 14. The Citizens Group believes that the challenges of legal framework and exercise of authority need to be viewed in the larger context of extremely weak or non-existent rule of law in the country. When the systems and institutions are forcibly made subservient to the unlawful will of rulers, the capacity of the State institutions to follow or enforce laws and rules becomes non-existent.
- 15. The bottomline of our field visit to District Attock, which is one among over 100 districts in the country: The Electoral Process is flawed in some important ways, but the social, political and administrative environment is well disposed to address these flaws. A positive signal from the top leadership, which has currently failed on its key responsibility to abide by and promote rule of law, can make a huge difference. The social and administrative infrastructure in Pakistan can sustain free and fair elections and a functioning democracy quite quickly. The situation at the grass-roots is neither hopeless nor incurable. Pakistan should not be seen as failed on its potential for democracy, much less a failed state.

CGEP Fact Finding Mission to Attock

Tuesday, January 15, 2008

Programme

Tuesday, January 15, 2008

| No. | Activity | Time | |
|-----|--|------------------|--|
| 1. | Meeting with | 09:30 - 10:30 am | |
| | Maj. (Retd.) Tahir Sadiq, District Nazim | | |
| | Attock | | |
| 2. | Meeting with | | |
| | Malik Amin Aslam Khan, Former | | |
| | Minister of State for Environment | | |
| | Division and Members of Attock Front | | |
| | for Free and Fair Elections | | |
| | - Malik Sohail Khan (NA 58 Attock- | | |
| | II: PML-N) | 10.15 | |
| | - Malik Shahan Khan (PP-15 | 10:45 am - 12:00 | |
| | Attock-I: PPP) | | |
| | - Col (Retd.) Shujah Khanzada (PP- | | |
| | 16 Attock-II: Elephant) | | |
| | - Aftab Khan Wardak (PP-16 | | |
| | Attock-II: Helicopter) | | |
| | - Sardar Muhammad Ali (PP-17 | | |
| | Attock-III: PML-N: Tiger) | | |
| 3. | Meeting with | 12:05 – 12:40 pm | |
| | Advocate Syed Azmat Ali Bukhari | | |
| | and other PPP Candidates: | | |
| | - Advocate Syed Munirul Haq (NA | | |
| | 57, Attock-I: MQM) | | |
| | - Sardar Shahnawaz (NA 58 Attock | | |
| | II: PPP) | | |
| | - Sardar Saleem Haider Khan (NA | | |
| | 59 Attock III: PPP) | | |
| | - Malik Shahan Khan (PP-15 | | |
| | Attock-I: PPP) | | |
| 4. | Meeting with | 12:45 – 2:00 pm | |
| | Malik Abdul Razzaq, District | · · · · · · · | |

| | Coordination Officer (DCO) Attock & Mr. Tariq Hanif Joiya | |
|----|--|------------------|
| 5. | District Police Officer Lunch | 2:15 - 03:00 pm |
| 6. | Meeting with Mr. Tariq Abbasi District Returning Officer and District & Session Judge Attock and | |
| | Chaudhry Abdul Haq, Returning Officer Malik Muhammad Rafique, Returning Officer Mr. Habibullah Amir, Returning Officer | 03:00 - 03:40 pm |
| 7. | Meeting with Sardar Mazher Hussain Assistant Election Commissioner, Attock | 04:00-04-30 pm |
| 8. | Meeting with Mr. Waseem Gulzar, PML-Q & Other Candidates: - Syed Ejaz Bukhari (PP 15 Attock-I: PML-Q) - Colonel (Retd.) Malik | 04:30 -5:3 pm |
| 9. | Interaction with the Media at the Attock Press Club | 06:00-07:00 |

<u>Appendix B</u>

Electoral Race in the District of Attock²

The final list of candidates with their election symbols vying for three (3) National (NA-57, NA-58, NA-59) and five (5) for Provincial Assembly seats (PP- 15, PP-16, PP-17, PP-18 and PP-19) in District Attock is as follows:

NA-57 ATTOCK-I: Returning Officer Chaudhry Abdul Haq allotted symbols to eight (8) aspirants:

- Ms. Eman Waseem (Fan)
- Malik Amin Aslam (Elephant)
- Sheikh Aftab Ahmed (PML-N: Tiger)
- Advocate Syed Azmat Ali Bukhari (PPP: Arrow)
- Hafiz Saeed Ahmad (MMA: Book)
- Qari Atiqur Rehman (Table)
- Muhammad Faisal Khanzada (Bus)
- Advocate Syed Munirul Haq (MQM: Kite)

NA-58 ATTOCK-II: Returning Officer Malik Muhammad Rafique allotted election symbols to five (5) candidates:

- Chaudhry Pervaiz Elahi (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Malik Ramzan (Bus)
- Sardar Shahnawaz (PPP: Arrow)
- Malik Sohail Khan (PML-N: Tiger)
- Abdul Salam Hasan Raza (MMA: Book)

NA-59 ATTOCK-III: Returning Officer Habibullah Amir allotted symbols to four (4) aspirants:

- Waseem Gulzar (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Advocate Malik Asif (PML-N: Tiger)
- Sardar Saleem Haidar Khan (PPP: Arrow)
- Iftikhar Ahmad Khan (Scooter).

PP-15 ATTOCK-I: The Returning Officer allotted election symbols to three (3) aspirants:

- Syed Ejaz Bukhari (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Malik Shahan Khan (PPP: Arrow)
- Sheikh Suleman Sarwar (PML-N: Tiger)

² http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/17/nat5.htm

PP-16 ATTOCK-II: The Returning Officer allotted election symbols to seven (7) candidates:

- Col (Retd.) Shujah Khanzada (Elephant)
- Qari Muhammad Ismail (Pomegranate)
- Zubair Khan (Tonga)
- Fazlur Rehman Wardak (PML-N: Tiger)
- Dr Naeem Awan (PPP: Arrow)
- Aftab Khan Wardak (Helicopter)
- Qari Atiqur Rehman (MMA: Book)

PP-17 ATTOCK-III: The Returning Officer allotted election symbols to five (5) aspirants:

- Sardar Muhammad Ali (PML-N: Tiger)
- Chaudhry Sher Ali (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Asad Zaman Khan (Bus)
- Ishtiaq Ahmed (PPP: Arrow)
- Shahabuddin Qureshi (MMA: Book)

PP-18 ATTOCK-IV: The Returning Officer allotted election symbols to three (3) candidates:

- Col (Retd.) Malik Muhammad Anwar (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Malik Khurram Ali Khan (PPP: Arrow)
- Malik Asif Ali Khan (PML-N: Tiger)

PP-19 ATTOCK-V: The Returning Officer allotted election symbols to six (6) candidates:

- Ms. Sadia Ahmed (Flower Vase)
- Sardar Mumtaz Khan (PML-N: Tiger)
- Malik Atabar (PML-Q: Bicycle)
- Sardar Muhammad Ameer (PPP: Arrow)
- Muhammad Ramzan (Bus)
- Abdul Salam Hasan Raza (MMA: Book)