

MONITOR

Implementation of National Action Plan to Counter Terrorism in Punjab

Volume 5:
October - December 2017



Executive Summary

Perhaps the biggest question mark on the effectiveness of implementation of the National Action Plan in nearly 3 years of its implementation confronted the State and society through the *Faizabad* sit-in.¹ That the Punjab Government allowed such a protest to traverse the province freely and allowed it to make the capital hostage raises serious questions on the commitment of the Government towards the NAP and the ethos guiding it. Beyond Punjab, the manner in which the Federal Government ended the *dharna* with active corroboration by the Army, capitulated the State to the demands of a mob has all but disastrous connotations written all over it. Subsequent statements by the leader of the protest and actions, such as the DG Rangers distributing cash amongst *dharna* protesters, have not only raised serious questions about the support of the Army for the protest but the State's ability to withstand mob pressures and effectively implement NAP. While this constituted as a flagrant violation across many NAP points, in particular it violated NAP point 3: *Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country* as the protesters fought a pitched battle to push the might of State back in the operation.





In the light of the above developments, this Monitor covers the fourth quarter of 2017. This Monitor uses the assessment of progress on implementation of NAP in the third quarter (July 2017- September 2017) as a baseline in order to report progress on NAP implementation during October to December 2017.

This Fifth Quarterly Monitor on Implementation of NAP in Punjab follows:

- i. First Monitor on Implementation of NAP covering two year period starting from January 2015 - December 2016
- ii. Second Quarterly Monitor on Implementation of NAP covering first quarter of 2017 (January 2017 – March 2017)
- iii. Third Quarterly NAP Monitor on Implementation of NAP covering the second quarter of 2017 (April 2017- June 2017)
- iv. Fourth Quarterly NAP Monitor on Implementation of NAP covering the third quarter of 2017 (July 2017 – September 2017)

The purpose behind monitoring of implementation of National Action Plan by PILDAT has been to urge that the Governments publicly share periodic status of implementation of the NAP. Moreover, PILDAT also believes that the Federal and Provincial Legislatures along with their relevant Standing Committees should seek periodic reports from the Governments, in order to effectively play their role of parliamentary oversight

Table 1: Traffic Light Method of Assessment

1	Green: The implementation process has worked well. Some improvements are needed. (Progress good)	
2	Green-Amber: The implementation process has worked relatively well. Improvements should be made. (Progress satisfactory)	
3	Amber-Red: The implementation process has been relatively poor. Significant improvements should be made. (Progress somewhat unsatisfactory)	
4	Red: The implementation process has been poor overall. Immediate and major changes need to be made. (Progress unsatisfactory)	

In this quarter, Three NAP points have witnessed regression in their status of implementation. These include *Point No.3: Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country*, *Point No. 9: Taking effective action against religious persecutions* and *Point No. 15 (Zero-tolerance for militancy in Punjab)*.

10 NAP points have showed no change in their level of implementation compared to the previous quarter. These include:

1. Point No. 5 Strict action against the literature, newspapers and magazine promoting hatred, extremism, sectarianism and intolerance
2. Point No. 6: Choking financing for terrorist and terrorist organizations
3. Point No. 7: Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations
4. Point No. 8: Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter terrorism force

1. For details, please see PILDAT Monitor on Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan, November 2017: <http://www.pildat.org/eventsdel.asp?detid=957#heading3>

Box 1: Implementation of NAP in Punjab

Of the 20 NAP points, 15 pertain to Punjab. While PILDAT has sought data from all Provincial Governments, as well as the Federal Government, the Government of Punjab, especially the Punjab Counter Terrorism Department (Punjab CTD) deserve accolades and appreciation for upholding requirements of transparency and public access through sharing data not only for the first two years (2015-2016) but also and through all quarters of 2017. While PILDAT awaits data from Federal Government as well as the other 3 Provinces in order to be able to carry out an informed comparative analysis on implementation of NAP across Pakistan, we wish to thank the Government of Punjab as well as the CTD Punjab for sharing performance of Punjab on the National Action Plan to citizens scrutiny and assessment. Moreover, we reiterate that the Federal Government should compile point-wise NAP data on the progress, or lack of it, by each province and periodically share the progress report with the public.



















































5. Point No. 10: Registration and regulation of religious seminaries
6. Point No. 11: Ban on glorification of terrorist and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media
7. Point No. 13: Communication network of terrorists will be dismantled completely
8. Point No. 14: Measures against abuse of social media for terrorism
9. Point No. 18: Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists) and
10. Point No. 20: Revamping of the Criminal Justice system

As in the previous quarter, PILDAT has not given assessment of status of implementation of 2 NAP Points due to insufficient data. These include Point No. 1, which calls for implementation of death sentences to those convicted of terrorism and Point No. 2, which calls for the institution of Military Courts.

The one point that has consistently received Green traffic light is Point No. 8. Point No. 8 calls for establishing and deploying a dedicated counter-terrorism force. This NAP Point has consistently seen steady implementation as the required strength of Counter-Terrorism Force and infrastructure developments remain the same as the previous quarter.

Table 2: Status of Implementation of NAP:

Point	Implementation Status January 2015 - December 2016	Implementation Status January - March 2017	Implementation Status April - June 2017	Implementation Status July - September 2017	Implementation Status October - December 2017
1 Implementation of death sentences of those convicted of terrorism			No assessment due to insufficient data	No assessment due to insufficient data	No assessment due to insufficient data
2 Special courts under the supervision of Army. The duration of these courts would be two years			No assessment due to insufficient data	No assessment due to insufficient data	No assessment due to insufficient data
3 Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country					
4 NACTA, the anti-terrorism institution, will be strengthened	Federal in Scope – Not Covered in this Monitor				
5 Strict action against the literature, newspapers, and magazines promoting hatred, extremism, sectarianism, and intolerance					
6 Choking financing for terrorist and terrorist organizations					

7	Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations					
8	Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter terrorism force					
9	Taking effective action against religious persecution					
10	Registration and regulation of religious seminaries					
11	Ban on glorification of terrorist and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media					
12	Administrative and development reforms in FATA with immediate focus on repatriation of IDPs	Federal in Scope – Not Covered in this Monitor				
13	Communication network of terrorists will be dismantled completely					
14	Measures against abuse of social media for terrorism					
15	Zero-tolerance for militancy in Punjab					
16	Ongoing operation in Karachi will be taken to its logical end	Not Pretaining to Punjab & Not Covered in this Monitor				
17	Balochistan Government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders	Not Pretaining to Punjab & Not Covered in this Monitor				
18	Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists					
19	Formulation of a comprehensive policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees, beginning with registration of all refugees	Not Pretaining to Punjab & Not Covered in this Monitor				
20	Revamping of the Criminal Justice System					

NAP Point No. 1: Implementation of death sentences of those convicted of terrorism

An Anti Terrorism Court handed three militants of banned organization, Balochistan Liberation Army, death sentences for killing 4 people in gas pipeline blast near Abadpur in Rahim Yar Khan in 2014. The names of the militants were Muhammad Ramzan, Miawa and Mehar Din.²

The data on total number of people on death row in Punjab under terrorism charges is not available, because of which the status of implementation on this point cannot be monitored effectively.

NAP Point No. 2: Special courts under the supervision of Army. The duration of these courts would be two year

As reported in the previous NAP monitors, the performance of Military Courts is a Federal Subject. Nonetheless, Provincial and Federal Government can both refer cases to the Military Courts.

The process though is cumbersome as only those cases where the military installations or military personnel were targeted are reportedly being considered for trial by military courts.

On November 10, 2017, Pakistan Government referred 29 cases to Military courts. Reportedly, the COAS, in a letter addressed to the Prime Minister, pointed out that military courts had not received any terrorism-related cases since January 2017.³ This resulted in the Federal Cabinet clearing 29 cases to be referred to Military Courts. Federal Minister for Interior, Mr. Ahsan Iqbal, also told the media that 80 more cases were pending approval by the Cabinet and “after this, the Interior Ministry will not have any more cases pending,” he said.⁴

The formation of the Military Courts in January 2015 was made possible by the Parliament when it passed the 21st Constitutional Amendment, 2015 (that had a sunset clause of two years and later reconstituted for another two years in January 2017) after the Peshawar Tragedy. The Federal and Provincial Governments have so far failed to reform the justice system so that military courts are not required to deal with the terrorism cases. If the Government is not forwarding the cases to the military courts in time and the COAS has to remind the Government on this count, it indicates a sorry state of efficiency in the Government.

While PILDAT has repeatedly asked the ISPR to provide provincial and federal data on number of cases received and tried by Military Courts, the ISPR has not been forthcoming in sharing the required data to allow assessment of the important NAP point number 1 and 2. Federal Government may do well by compiling and releasing a periodic progress report on the implementation of NAP.

NAP Point No. 3: Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country

While the total number of people arrested by CTD Punjab went down from 54 in the previous quarter to 52 in the current quarter, total number of convictions this quarter were 58, which shows an increase of 41% from the previous quarter.

As mentioned in previous quarter, the cases that were in trial for past three years are coming to conclusion hence there have been a rise in conviction statistics.

To re-cap, from January 2015 to December 2016, the total number of arrests made were 1,016 and total number of convictions stand at 313. The conviction rate for this entire period is therefore 30.8%.

At the national level three terrorist attacks took place, two in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and one in Balochistan, which killed 40 people and injured 67 people. Whereas the CTD in other provinces arrested 3 and killed 8 militants in different operations.

The major downward movement on this NAP Point has been witnessed due to Faizabad sit-in⁵ that raise questions on effectiveness of implementation on this point.



NAP Point No. 4: NACTA, the anti-terrorism institution, will be strengthened

This point pertains to the jurisdiction of the Federal Government and is therefore not covered in this Monitor.

2. 'Three BLA militants handed death sentence in pipeline blast case' Daily Pakistan, November 11, 2017 can be accessed at: <https://en.dailypakistan.com.pk/pakistan/three-bla-militants-handed-death-sentence-in-pipeline-blast-case/>

3. 29 terrorism-related cases cleared to be sent to military courts: Ahsan Iqbal, Dawn, November 4, 2017: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1368211>

4. For details, please see PILDAT Monitor on Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan, November 2017: <http://www.pildat.org/eventsdel.asp?detid=957#heading3>

5. Please see PILDAT perspective on the Faizabad Sit-in in the PILDAT Monitor on Civil-Military Relations, November 2017 at: <http://www.pildat.org/eventsdel.asp?detid=957#heading1>

NAP Point No. 5: Strict action against the literature, newspapers, and magazines promoting hatred, extremism, sectarianism, and intolerance

During this quarter, no new arrests were made or cases filed under this NAP point. There no changes in number convictions either.

A sit-in camp was held by Tehreek Siraat-e-Mustaqeem, led by its leader Allama Ashraf Asif Jalali, and other religious parties at Faisal Chowk in Lahore. There were a lot of slogans painted on the walls and booths of city traffic police against Ahmadiya Community.⁶



NAP Point No. 6: Choking financing for terrorist and terrorist organizations

Number of arrests for terrorist financing increased from 0 in the previous quarter to 1 in this quarter. The number of cases registered also saw an increase from 0 in the previous quarter to 1 in this quarter. There were no new convictions made hence the rate of conviction stayed at 0. Some of the previous cases are still under trial.

Despite facing international pressure emanating from the International terror finance watchdog, the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to demonstrate that Pakistan has blocked financial routes of JuD, JeM and its affiliates, there has been little movement on the issue. Its only after mounting of recent international pressures that Pakistan has recently taken numerous step including banning of Lashkar-e-Taiba, Jaish-e-Muhammad, Jamaat-ud-Dawa and Falah-e-Insaniat Foundation. Overall, this point requires a lot of improvement.



NAP Point No. 7: Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organization

No re-emergence of proscribed organizations was reported during this quarter though Hafiz Muhammad Saeed was released from custody on November 23, 2017 due to Court's order of lack of evidence.

However, Pakistan has been dragging its feet on banning the JuD, JeM and its affiliates despite the UNSC resolution. Its only

now that after reported displeasure by UNSC, action has begun to be taken on this issue.

Lack of uniformity of approach on this point between Government and State institutions has been a major hurdle in effective implementation of this point and therefore requires urgent and holistic review of progress.



NAP Point No. 8: Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter terrorism force

This NAP point has consistently seen steady implementation as the required strength of Counter Terrorism Force and infrastructure developments remain the same as the previous quarter.

A total of 37 terrorist threats were thwarted in this quarter compared to 39 in the previous quarter, which is a decrease of 5.13%. The number of potential terrorists arrested by CTD was 52, which is a decrease of 7.14% from the previous quarter.

Overall, the number of threats decreased shows that the situation in Punjab regarding this point is improving.



NAP Point No. 9: Taking effective action against religious persecution

As there were no incidents of religious persecution reported in Punjab during this quarter, there were no subsequent arrests, cases registered or convictions made.

A blatant violation of this point continued through the Faizabad sit-in that openly and threateningly maligned religious minorities and with the State's capitulation to the mob has further eroded effectiveness of implementation on this point

Moreover, in open violation of this point and relevant laws, many shops and markets across Lahore and other parts of the province openly display notices and banners against Ahmedis stating that Ahmedis can not enter inside or do business with such establishments.



6. 'Ahmadis demands end to campaign against them to ensure country's security', Pakistan Today, November 29, 2017 can be accessed at: <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2017/11/29/ahmadis-demand-end-to-campaign-against-them-to-ensure-countrys-security/>

NAP Point No. 10: Registration and regulation of religious seminaries

According to CTD Punjab's figure, no new seminaries came into being during this quarter. There was an increase in total number of applications for registration from 80 in previous quarter to 206 in this quarter. Out of these 206 applications only 12 received NoC from CTD Punjab.



NAP Point No. 11: Ban on glorification of terrorists and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media

This NAP point pertains primarily to the jurisdiction of the Federal Government, as Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority is the body tasked to deal with regulation of electronic media.

According to the data provided by CTD Punjab, 1 arrest was made in this quarter compared to 4 in the previous quarter. Only 1 case was registered in this quarter compared to 3 in the previous quarter. In previous quarters, there were no convictions made whereas 8 convictions were made in this quarter.

The implementation of this point has been constant as terrorists and terrorist organizations are not given any airtime.



NAP Point No. 12: Administrative and development reforms in FATA with immediate focus on repatriation of IDPs

This point pertains to the jurisdiction of the Federal Government and therefore not included in this Monitor

NAP Point No. 13: Communication network of terrorists will be dismantled completely

Communication networks are defined broadly as anything ranging from actual cells of an organization to their electronic communication, radio channels, and covert methods of communication.

While the CTD monitors these networks, other agencies such as

FIA and NACTA are also responsible for implementation of this point.

The previous quarter saw a terrorist attack in Lahore due to which it was observed that terrorist networks continue to operate in the province. There were no terrorist attacks in this quarter.



NAP Point No. 14: Measures against abuse of social media for terrorism

It is important to note that while social media offers an easy playground for terrorist organisations in various aspects of their work, it also provides a rather effective tool for surveillance for the counter-terrorism force. LEAs including CTDs can keep an eye on the different social media accounts and pages, and the followers of these accounts, and receive very useful intelligence in this way. Because of this every case under observation is not always brought to trial right away.

There were 2 arrests made and 2 cases registered in this quarter, as opposed to zero arrests made and zero cases registered in the previous quarter. The rate of conviction for this NAP Point stands at 0% for this quarter.

According to Federal Minister of Interior, Mr. Ahsan Iqbal, social media is the platform used by terrorist organizations as a source of communication and all the social media websites should be monitored and analysed closely. According to him the people of Pakistan are being deceived by fake news on social media hence therefore he ordered FIA's cyber-crime division to observe such activities.⁷ But measures were taken against whoever spoke against the government or state institutions. None of the arrests were made in regards to abuse of social media for terrorism.

During the Faizabad sit-in news channel, Facebook and Youtube went off air as PEMRA didnot want any live coverage of Faizabad sit-in to be aired for the nation due to "utmost sensitivity".

Additionally, as mentioned in the previous quarter, it is not always useful to ban social media accounts/activities as these can lead to terrorist masterminds and their plans.



7. 'No absolute freedom on social media, warns Ahsan Iqbal' The Express Tribune, October 25, 2017 can be accessed at:<https://tribune.com.pk/story/1540470/1-no-absolute-freedom-social-media-warns-ahsan-iqbal/>

NAP Point No. 15: Zero-tolerance for militancy in Punjab

In the fourth quarter of 2017, 52 arrests were made and 40 cases registered against militants in Punjab. There were also 58 convictions, which is a 59% increase in conviction from the previous quarter.

In addition, the CTD reported that four terrorists are killed in Punjab out of the eight that opened fire against the CTD at a check post in Faisalabad.⁸ The incident shows that CTD have opted to have zero tolerance against militant activities.

Moreover, the check posts on Sargodha Road were established as they received information about militants entering Faisalabad. According to CTD the militants belonged to Tehreek Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and were planning a terrorist attack in Faisalabad.

One of the problems that arise with this point is how the word 'militancy' could be defined as. Militancy can be defined as coercing someone to do something. Such as the fact that Mr. Khadim Husain Rizvi came into terms with the Government that Rana Sanaullah Khan, Punjab's Law Minister, would appear in front of clerics to clarify his position with regards to his pro-Ahmadi comments and the board of clerics would decide fate of Punjab's Law Minister.⁹ Moreover, in relation to Faizabad sit-in, demands accepted, such as easier to lodge blasphemy cases, only leads to restricting an individual's freedom of choice. Restricting an individual's freedom coerces the individual do things, which are not of his, or her choice can be called an act of militancy.

Even though sabotage of militant plans shows an improvement on this point but forcefully giving into the demands of certain groups shows that militancy still exists in Punjab.



NAP Point No. 16: On going operation in Karachi will be taken to its logical end

This point pertains to the jurisdiction of the Federal Government and is therefore not covered in this Monitor.

8. 'Four terrorists killed in Faisalabad CTD Operation' The Express Tribune, November 25, 2017 can be accessed at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1568143/1-four-terrorists-killed-faisalabad-ctd-operation/>
9. "Much more' agreed with govt than public knows: Rizvi' The Express Tribune, November 28, 2017 can be accessed at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1570360/1-much-agreed-govt-public-knows-rizvi/>
10. 'Visit of Interior Minister to NACTA' NACTA Pakistan, December 20, 2017 can be accessed at: <https://nacta.gov.pk/visit-of-interior-minister-to-nacta/>
11. [Chief Justice urges lawmakers to reform judicial system, Dawn, January 13, 2018](#)

NAP Point No. 17: Balochistan Government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders

This point pertains to the jurisdiction of the Federal and the Balochistan Government and is therefore not covered in this Monitor.

NAP Point No. 18: Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists

There were no incidents of sectarian violence reported in Punjab during this quarter; there were no arrests or cases registered. The status of implementation on this point therefore remains unchanged.



NAP Point No. 19: Formulation of a comprehensive policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees, beginning with registration of all refugees

This point pertains to the jurisdiction of the Federal Government and is therefore not included in this Monitor.

NAP Point No. 20: Revamping of the Criminal Justice System

Federal Minister of Interior, Mr. Ahsan Iqbal met with NACTA officials on December 20, 2017. He asserted that NACTA should ensure implementation of criminal justice laws in Pakistan.¹⁰ The Supreme Court, of late, has begun to lay stress on the reforms of the justice system including asking legislators to revise laws.¹¹

